# PRO ECCLESIA

A JOURNAL OF CATHOLIC AND EVANGELICAL THEOLOGY

VOL. III WINTER 1994 NO. 1

PRO ECCLESIA is a journal of theology published by the Center for Catholic and Evangelical Theology. It seeks to give contemporary expression to the one apostolic faith and its classic traditions, working for and manifesting the church's unity by research, theological construction, and free exchange of opinion. Members of its advisory council represent communities committed to the authority of Holy Scripture, ecumenical dogmatic teaching and the structural continuity of the church, and are themselves dedicated to maintaining and invigorating these commitments. The journal publishes biblical, liturgical, historical and doctrinal articles that promote or illumine its purposes.

## EDITORS

CARL E. BRAATEN . . Center for Catholic and Evangelical Theology, Northfield, Minnesota

ROBERT W. JENSON . . . St. Olaf College

## ASSOCIATE EDITORS

JAMES BUCKLEY . Loyola College in Maryland

PAUL R. HINLICKY . . Comenius University, Bratislava, Slovakia

BRUCE D. MARSHALL . . St. Olaf College

K. PAUL WESCHE . . St. Herman's Orthodox Church, Minneapolis

## BOOK REVIEW EDITOR

DAVID S. CUNNINGHAM . . . . . University of St. Thomas

## STAFF

MARTIN A. CHRISTIANSEN . Managing Editor

DONNA ROCHE . . . . Business Manager

FREDERICK J. SCHUMACHER . . . . . Executive Director, American Lutheran Publicity Bureau

## ADVISORY COUNCIL

SUSAN ASHBROOK-HARVEY Brown University

ROBERT BENNE . . . Roanoke College

WALTER BOUMAN . Trinity Lutheran Seminary

EUGENE BRAND . Lutheran World Federation

JOHN BRECK . . . St. Vladimir's Orthodox Theological Seminary

J. A. DiNOIA . . Dominican House of Studies, Washington, D.C.

AVERY DULLES . . . Fordham University

GABRIEL FACKRE . . . Andover Newton Theological School

GÜNTHER GASSMANN . . Faith and Order, World Council of Churches

VIGEN GUROIAN . Loyola College in Maryland

STANLEY HAUERWAS . . The Divinity School, Duke University

GEORGE HUNSINGER . . . Bangor Theological Seminary

ELISABETH KOENIG . . . . The General Theological Seminary

JOHN McGUCKIN . . University of Leeds

RICHARD JOHN NEUHAUS . . Institute on Religion and Public Life

MARK NOLL . . . . Wheaton College

THOMAS ODEN . . . . Drew University

WOLFHART PANNENBERG . . University of Munich

WILLIAM C. PLACHER . . Wabash College

JEAN PORTER . . University of Notre Dame

JOHN RODGERS . Episcopal School for Ministry

MICHAEL ROOT . . Institute for Ecumenical Research, Strasbourg

DAVID SCOTT . Virginia Theological Seminary

FRANK SENN . Immanuel Lutheran Church, Evanston, Illinois

MARK SWANSON . . Division for Global Mission, ELCA, Cairo, Egypt

THEODORE STYLIANOPOULOS . Holy Cross Greek Orthodox School of Theology

PHILIP TURNER . . Berkeley Divinity School of Yale University

GEOFFREY WAINWRIGHT Duke Divinity School

JARED WICKS . . . Pontificia Universita Gregoriana

DAVID WILLIS . . . Princeton Seminary

J. ROBERT WRIGHT . . . . The General Theological Seminary

DAVID YEAGO . . . Lutheran Theological Southern Seminary

ROBIN DARLING YOUNG . . . Catholic University

## BOARD OF THE CENTER

CARL E. BRAATEN . . Executive Director

HARLEY C. CARLSON . . Mayo Clinic, Rochester, Minnesota

WALTER D. CARLSON . . Grace Lutheran Church, Lancaster, Pennsylvania

JAMES R. CRUMLEY . . . . . Chairman Lutheran Theological Southern Seminary

KARL P. DONFRIED . . . Smith College

ROBERT W. JENSON . . Associate Director

WILLIAM H. LAZARETH . Bishop Emeritus, Metropolitan New York Synod, ELCA

GEORGE A. LINDBECK . Yale Divinity School

ROBERT L. WILKEN . . University of Virginia


---


PRO ECCLESIA, ISSN 1063–8512, A Journal of Catholic and Evangelical Theology, is published quarterly (winter, spring, summer, and fall) by the Center for Catholic and Evangelical Theology, 5642 Endwood Trail, Northfield, MN 55057, in cooperation with the American Lutheran Publicity Bureau, P.O. Box 327, Delhi, NY 13753. Application to mail at second class postage rates is pending at Delhi, New York and additional mailing offices. Subscription rates: (US $) in the United States and Canada: $25 for one year; $45 for two years. Canadian subscriptions, add $3 per year; overseas subscriptions, add $5 per year. Checks should be made payable to ALPB/PRO ECCLESIA, P.O. Box 327, Delhi, NY 13753. **Subscribers are requested to direct change of address or other problems to: ALPB, P.O. Box 327, Delhi, NY 13753**; Phone: 607 746-7511. All editorial correspondence should be directed to Dr. Carl E. Braaten or Dr. Robert W. Jenson, Center for Catholic and Evangelical Theology, 5642 Endwood Trail, Northfield, MN 55057; Phone: 507 663-1842 / Fax: 507 645-2756. Send Book Reviews to David S. Cunningham, Dept. of Theology, University of St. Thomas, St. Paul, MN 55105-1096. POSTMASTER: Send address changes to: PRO ECCLESIA, P.O. Box 327, Delhi, NY 13753. If you receive a damaged copy, please contact Donna Roche: 607-746-7511. Printed in the United States of America

# CONTENTS

## OPINION

THAT THEY MAY ALL BE ONE . . . . . 5
Harry W. Shipps

THE PORVOO–STATEMENT —
A POSSIBLE ECUMENICAL BREAKTHROUGH? . . . . . 11
Ola Tjørhom

A CHALCEDONIAN HERMENEUTIC . . . . . 18
Carl E. Braaten

THE YOUTH AND AGE OF
THEOLOGICAL JOURNALS . . . . . 22
Carl E. Braaten and Robert W. Jenson

## ARTICLES

THE ECUMENICAL DIALOGUES:
SITUATION – PROBLEMS – PERSPECTIVES . . . . . 24
Harding Meyer

NOT A SOLITARY GOD:
THE TRIUNE GOD OF THE BIBLE . . . . . 36
Robert L. Wilken

THE CHURCH AS A
WORSHIPPING COMMUNITY . . . . . 56
Geoffrey Wainwright

SEVEN THESES TOWARD AN ECUMENICAL ECONOMIC ETHIC FOR THE 1990s . . . . . 68
John R. Mason

## DOCTORES ECCLESIAE

ST. IGNATIUS OF ANTIOCH: THE CRITERION OF ORTHODOXY AND THE MARKS OF CATHOLICITY . . . . . 89
Kenneth Paul Wesche

## REVIEW ESSAY

Joseph Augustine DiNoia:
*The Diversity of Religions* . . . . . 110
Reviewed by Paul Varo Martinson

## BOOK REVIEWS

Alvin F. Kimel, Jr.
*Speaking the Christian God. The Holy Trinity and the Challenge of Feminism* . . . . . 114
Reviewed by Catherine Mowry LaCugna

Richard John Neuhaus
*America Against Itself — Moral Vision and the Public Order* . . . . . 116
Reviewed by Robert Benne

Paul McGlasson
*God the Redeemer: A Theology of the Gospel* . . . . . 118
Reviewed by Steven D. Paulson

Index (1992-1993) . . . . . 127

# CONTENTS

## OPINION

A LESSON TO US ALL . . . . . 133
Robert W. Jenson

RENEWAL IN THEOLOGY FOR THE CHURCH . . . . . 136
Carl E. Braaten

## ARTICLES

CANONICAL INTERPRETATION:
A NEW APPROACH TO BIBLICAL TEXTS . . . . . 141
Rolf Rendtorff

THE NEW TESTAMENT AND THE NICENE DOGMA:
A CONTRIBUTION TO THE RECOVERY
OF THEOLOGICAL EXEGESIS . . . . . 152
David S. Yeago

THE FACE OF THE SPIRIT . . . . . 165
John Breck

FANTASY, THE CAPITAL SINS,
THE ENNEAGRAM, AND SELF-ACCEPTANCE:
AN ESSAY IN ASCETICAL THEOLOGY . . . . . 179
Frans Jozef van Beeck, S.J.

THE ECCLESIOLOGICAL BASIS
OF THE OFFICE OF THE DEACON:
THE CONTRIBUTION OF SVEN-ERIK BRODD . . . . . 197
Frank C. Senn

DIAKONIA — A BASIC TASK OF THE CHURCH . . . . . 206
Eero Huovinen

THE DEMOCRATIC POLICING OF CHRISTIANITY . . . . . 215
Stanley Hauerwas

## REVIEW ESSAYS

Robert W. Jenson
*Unbaptized God: The Basic Flaw in Ecumenical Theology* . . . . . 232
Reviewed by George A. Lindbeck

Jean-Luc Marion
*God Without Being; Hors-texte* . . . . . 239
Reviewed by Reinhard Hütter

## BOOK REVIEWS

Catherine L. Albanese
*America: Religions and Religion*
Mark A. Noll
*A History of Christianity in the United States and Canada* . . . . . 245
Reviewed by Paul A. Baglyos

Aidan Nichols, O.P.
*Rome and the Eastern Churches* . . . . . 247
Reviewed by Robert M. Arida

Donald K. McKim, ed.
*Major Themes in the Reformed Tradition* . . . . . 249
Reviewed by Robert Redman

# CONTENTS

## CORRESPONDENCE

ONLY BELIEVERS ARE CREATED BY THE SPIRIT . . . . . 261
Roland D. Zimany

REPLY TO ROLAND ZIMANY . . . . . 264
Bruce D. Marshall

## OPINION

THE JESUS SEMINAR AND THE THIRD QUEST . . . . . 266
Arland J. Hultgren

REFLECTIONS ON *THE SPLENDOR OF TRUTH* . . . . . 271
Robert Benne

## ARTICLES

ALEXANDER SCHMEMANN:
Father and Teacher of the Church . . . . . 275
Michael P. Plekon

EVANGELICAL-CATHOLIC DIALOGUE:
Basis, Boundaries, Benefits . . . . . 289
J. Daryl Charles

## A SYMPOSIUM ON THE CHURCH

COERCION OR PERSUASION?
In Search of the Authority of Dogma . . . . . 306
David S. Cunningham

LIBERAL AND CONSERVATIVE —
OR CATHOLIC AND EVANGELICAL?:
Some Limits to the Debate over the Public Character of Theology . . . . 324
James J. Buckley

THE CHURCH AS PUBLIC:
Dogma, Practice, and the Holy Spirit . . . . . 334
Reinhard Hütter

## REVIEW ESSAY

Hans W. Frei
*Types of Christian Theology* . . . . . 362
Reviewed by Michael G. Cartwright

## BOOK REVIEWS

Brian A. Gerrish
*Grace and Gratitude: The Eucharistic Theology of John Calvin* . . . . . 373
Reviewed by Geoffrey Wainwright

Michael P. Plekon and William S. Weicher, eds.
*The Church: Selected Writings of Arthur Carl Piepkorn* . . . . . 374
Reviewed by George Tavard

James J. Buckley
*Seeking the Humanity of God:*
*Practices, Doctrines, and Catholic Theology* . . . . . 376
Reviewed by David S. Cunningham

George Tavard
*The Church, Community of Salvation* . . . . . 379
Reviewed by Susan K. Wood

# CONTENTS

## CORRESPONDENCE

IT COULD HAVE BEEN... . . . . 389
Alvin F. Kimel, Jr.

DUPLEX VERBUM . . . . . 395
Ronald F. Marshall

## OPINION

MAKING THEOLOGY COME ALIVE IN THE PARISH . . . . . 397
David W. Johnson

OLD TESTAMENT OR HEBREW SCRIPTURES? . . . . . 402
James R. Edwards

ROBERT WILKEN . . . . . 405
Robert W. Jenson

WHAT PRICE UNITY? . . . . . 407
Carl E. Braaten

## ARTICLES

COMPARATIVE THEOLOGY vs.
REACTIVE THEOLOGY:
Jewish and Christian Approaches to the Presence of God . . . . . 411
Isaac C. Rottenberg

THE LUTHERAN-EPISCOPAL CONCORDAT:
What Does It Say and Why Does It Matter? . . . . . 419
Bruce D. Marshall

EPISCOPAL OVERSIGHT
AND ECCLESIASTICAL DISCIPLINE:
On the Decline of a Practice . . . . . 436
Philip Turner

THE DOCTRINE OF JUSTIFICATION:
Lutheran Lessons for Anglicans
in Search of a Confessional Identity . . . . . 455
R. R. Reno

## DOCTORES ECCLESIAE

LIGHT FROM BYZANTIUM:
The Significance of Palamas' Doctrine of Theosis . . . . . 483
A. N. Williams

## BOOK REVIEWS

Robert L. Wilken
*The Land Called Holy:*
*Palestine in Christian History and Thought* . . . . . 497
Reviewed by Mark N. Swanson

David S. Cunningham
*Faithful Persuasion:*
*In Aid of a Rhetoric of Christian History* . . . . . 499
Reviewed by Eugene F. Rogers

Paul Bradshaw
*The Search for the Origins of Christian Worship:*
*Sources and Methods for the Study of Early Liturgy* . . . . . 502
Reviewed by Jan Michael Joncas

Gerald R. McDermott
*One Holy and Happy Society:*
*The Public Theology of Jonathan Edwards* . . . . . 505
Reviewed by Daniel Sack

Jon Levenson
*The Hebrew Bible, the Old Testament and Historical Criticism* . . . . . 507
Reviewed by David Penchansky